Twitter Thread by Mirwais Hotaki

Mirwais Hotaki
@ThoughtAnalyst

In this Tweet, Andrew's inquiry led me to reflect.

During my time in the Taliban, I wondered how the issue of tribal interplay will be solved.

I will provide a basic synapsis & some thoughts & examples.

> Taliban often try to score political points by claiming they're not against women's education; that it's "the people" who don't want it. Why does a group that imposes its rule need "the people's" approval for anything?
>
> — Andrew Quilty (@andrewquilty) December 30, 2020

In some remote areas of Afghanistan, tribal dictum is seen as axiomatic in family matters, irrespective if Taliban (TB) exist.

In some rural villages, not all tribal elders are pro-TB & some are pro-Kabul Regime (KR). (recall the son who is TB & father KR)

It may be that the TB presence is reflected by 2-3 men in the entire village.

Though the TB do sustain control, in some cases, due to the cultural context, they wont override an elder's position. Why?

Here's an example. Suppose Bobzai is a tribal elder

Bobzai has 2 daughters & a son. Now the son could be a TB, yet Bobzai himself adheres to Pashtunwali.

Though the TB maintain control over the area, if Bobzai orders his son that I don't want my daughters to leave the home,

the son won't likely challenge the position of his father due to Pashtunwali.

Although, Islamically, the son is correct that his sisters should be allowed in school.

Yet, in this case, culturally, to save "face", the son may keep the dispute hidden.

Ive debated with tribal elders over this issue.

Yet every discussion needs a time & place. This cultural issue is also prevalent in Kabul & other areas.

For ex., PTM with Pashtun nationalism, yet in Pashtunwali, what are women inheritance rights?

None.

Also, take into account, priorities.

Do I believe that a rural village that is being droned, bombed & air-struck non-stop, that their main focus is convincing Elders on women/men's education at this moment of time?

No. (except for me & Khalid)

Are the Taliban are addressing the cultural issues? Yes.

Recall Mullah Umar (RH) issuing Edict 104 where one of the first times in Afghan modern history, women were not forced to marry their widow's brother as it is commanded in Pashtunwali.

The TB do address these issues, yet they are given preference in terms of importance.

For example in Logar, a tribal elder passed away & the sons refused to share the sale of the land with the sister.

Though the Taliban did not exert complete control of that area, the woman was left on the street, no one cared for her. (KR ignored her pleas due to "cultural" Pashtunwali)

She approached the Taliban & asked for help.

The Taliban said give us 3 days.

3 days later, her brothers apologized & gave her share of the land sale.

So when inquiring to the level of influence do tribal elders hold on the Taliban, vice versa.

It really is a case by case analysis in this regard.

Explicit ruling mandates the Taliban to abide by the Quran & Sunnah.

Yet there are fringe cases where some conservative traditional Pashtuns wish to keep their privacy matters in the home.

This is similar in the U.S.

You have the orthodox Jews who solve their disputes amongst their community, refusing to go to courts.

Does the tribal code grip Taliban explicit policy? No.

It is non-existent in that regard as the Quran & Sunnah is the explicit Taliban policy.

Yet in some areas, an Imam could solve a dispute & may not inform the Taliban of whether he took culture into context.

Another example is in the past 19 years, thousands joined the Taliban without a deep understanding of Islamic rulings, yet they fight to remove occupying forces after being bombed.

Though they have control over that village, they may not interfere in some cultural customs.

As a whole, I do believe when the Taliban re-builds Afghanistan with all Afghans united, they will exert efforts to engage & educate elders.

Yet every society has their cultural customs to account for & requires time.

There is also an anachronistic idea to keep in mind.

We are engaging in a remote area with Elders whose thought process cannot be forced to accept on one go.

This is where the Dawah occurs. Elders require time to adjust to the world we live in.

Rome was not built in a day.

Lastly, Andrew, starting with a rich comment such as "Taliban try to score political points"

The Taliban don't need to score political points.

The IEA maintains an Islamic system at its core based on the Quran & Sunnah.

On the fringes, events occur that we are unaware of, requiring a case by case analysis.

We have been working to resolve these fringe issues.

Unfort., we were invaded by 140 countries in the process, so there is a slight delay.

Also, keep in mind the devastation of War in some remote parts on the mental state.

For many, Pashtunwali is all they know to keep going.

As mentioned some tribal elders in remote parts of Paktia/Waziristan do not see women's/men's education as a top priority.

Keep this ex. in mind.

When you read about a family that is droned or killed, even if it is 1 person.

You have to now accept the possibility, that you are now at war with that entire village.

Sometimes, they are not as educated & still follow cultural customs.

With that being said, Im confident the Taliban will do their utmost in est. the necessity of education for all.

These initiatives are based on the Quran & Sunnah, & for the betterment of Afghanistan with all stakeholders involved.