

Twitter Thread by Shubham Sharma



Shubham Sharma

@skyesins



Thread on Evolution of Sino-India Border

I expect followers not to tag official govt handles and create unnecessary hype.

This thread includes generic information of the border post 1987 as the longitude-latitude wise information is only available with Army and not in public domain. Post 1987 information is taken from satellite imageries, generic archive records available in public domain.

The modern nation states are based on shared idea of their definition, some might be synthetic but they all are based on a common definition. Territorially, China considers itself as a nation state having same borders as that of Qing Dynasty

while India considers itself as a civilizational state between Himalayas and Indian Ocean whose boundary is based on long customs and latest treaties inherited by Dogras, Hill states, Sikkim, Bhutan Kingdom and British India on one side and the Tibetan Empire.

which was nominally independent under Qing and the Qing had authorized them to have treaties which they refused by 1920s.

Lets first go back to 2 main great Chinese extents-

Ming Dynasty with independent Tibet 1368-1644

Güshi Khan of the Khoshut in 1641 overthrew the prince of Tsang and made the 5th Dalai Lama the highest spiritual and political authority in Tibet. the 5th Dalai Lama conducted foreign policy independently of the Qing, on the basis of his spiritual authority amongst the Mongolian

. The Dalai Lama then embraced Chinese sovereignty but under nominal autonomy. The Dalai Lama would assign territories to Mongol tribes, and these decisions were routinely confirmed by the Emperor.

This is Khoshut which doesnot include Arunachal Pradesh and Ladakh as both of them had already been out of Tibetan control by now. Aksai Chin was a buffer land.

The Dzungars invaded Tibet in 1720, and in response the Qing sent expedition to Tibet and A Chinese protectorate over Tibet (described by Stein as "sufficiently mild and flexible to be accepted by the Tibetan government") was established at this time

, with a garrison at Lhasa, and Kham was annexed to Sichuan. The Chinese thus inherited the Khoshut border which excluded the Aksai Chin, Arunachal and Ladakh.

The defeat of the 1791 Nepalese invasion increased the Qing's control over Tibet.

The ambans took control of Tibetan frontier defense and foreign affairs. This is when the Tibetans for the first time claimed Ladakh, Aksai, and Arunachal as their territory however Ladakh was an independent kingdom by then while Arunachal and Aksai were buffer zones

The Tibetans also had no military might to assert control neither the Chinese cared.
This is 1820 qing claim possibly at the behest of Ambans.

Between 1820-1915 again the Qing lose central control over Tibet and authorize the Tibetans to negotiate treaties with British as the East India Company was already in Eastern Sector.

Meanwhile the Dogras annexed independent Ladakh to Dogra regime in 1835, inheriting the same borders with again Aksai Chin as buffer zone. The Dogra defeat in Sino Dogra war of 1842 and Treaty of Chushul demarcated the rough border between Dogras and Tibetan empire.

This was the rough boundary marked by a wide pen putting large lands into buffer zones. Clever dogras thus assigned British to mark their border to assert their control. W. H. Johnson, a civil servant proposed the "Johnson Line" in 1865, which put Aksai Chin in Jammu and Kashmir.

This was the time of the Dungan revolt, when China did not control Xinjiang, so this line was never presented to the Chinese. Johnson presented this line to the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir, who then claimed the 18,000 square kilometres contained within his territory

Aksai Chin was now claimed under Dogra control who built forts till the crest of Kun Lun Mountains. This is for the first time in history any country claimed the buffer of Aksai Chin. Arunachal on the other hand was still a buffer
This is the boundary which india officially claim

The tibetians however rejected it and In 1899, Britain proposed a revised boundary, and decided to partition Aksai Chin. This boundary is called Macartney-MacDonald Line, to the Chinese in 1899 who accepted it. Thus half of Aksai Chin comes to Chinese control.

In 1911 the Xinhai Revolution resulted in the collapse of central power in China and thus British again sent expedition to Tibet resulting in Tibetan accepting defeat

and British again annexing entire Aksai Chin and coming again back to 1865 Johnson Line and subsequently cemented the position in 1914 Simla Agreement.

This is the border Republic of India has inherited and is its official claim based on Dogra and 1914 Simla maps.

From 1917 to 1933, the "Postal Atlas of China", published by the Government of China in Peking had shown the boundary in Aksai Chin as per the Johnson line, which runs along the Kunlun mountains

China has itself shown Aksai Chin as part of India till 1933 in its own maps. The "Peking University Atlas", published in 1925, also put the Aksai Chin in India.

Map published by China in 1933 putting Aksai Chin inside India.

Upon independence in 1947, the government of India fixed its official boundary in the west, which included the Aksai Chin, in a manner that resembled the Ardagh–Johnson Line. India's basis for defining the border was "chiefly by its British India map survey, 1914 agreement

Therefore the official border is From the Karakoram Pass the Indian claim line extends northeast of the Karakoram Mountains north of the salt flats of the Aksai Chin,² set a boundary at the Kunlun Mountains, and incorporating part of the Karakash River and Yarkand River watershed

. From there, it runs east along the Kunlun Mountains, before turning southwest through the Aksai Chin salt flats, through the Karakoram Mountains, and then to Pangong Lake.

Now let us come to eastern Sector ie McMahon line. British India annexed Assam in northeastern India in 1826, by Treaty of Yandabo . Uptill now Arunachal was still an unmanned buffer zone between India and China similar to Nagaland, Mizoram and Chin states to Burma

The British annexed all these Chin states to Myanmar and Naga territories to India finishing any scope for Chinese. The British and Tibetan negotiators signed the Simla Convention and more detailed map as a bilateral accord.

The McMahon line was signed in 1914 putting entire Arunachal into Indian territory. The basis of British and India was The high watershed of the Himalayas which was proposed as the border between India and its northern neighbours

as the Himalayas were the ancient boundaries of the Indian subcontinent and thus should be the modern boundaries of British India and later the Republic of India

During World War II, with India's east threatened by Japanese troops and with the threat of Chinese expansionism, British troops secured Tawang for extra defence, thus effectively annexing Arunachal. China was still not controlling Tibet by now.

Sikkim border was never an issue and Chinese accepted it as their undisputed border.

Let us come to post independence.

The Chinese built the road and India was not knowing since 1957, when India protested the Chinese claimed that they have already annexed half of Aksai Chin

So in 1959 they portrayed innocence that they don't want war and proposed a 1959 claim line and then proposed by Chau Enlai.

This claim line includes 70% of Aksai chin but includes arunachal as a part of India.

This is blunder which Chinese think they have committed. They are thus entangled in their own folly. If they consider 1959 line as true border, it puts arunachal into india

while if they reject 1959 line and consider Johnson line, it puts both Arunachal and Aksai chin inside India. In both the cases Arunachal is considered to be part of India.

This is 1959 claim line, which puts even Galwan, Depsang Plains, Demchok, Ukdungle, Finger 8 , Hot springs well inside Indian Territory.

In 24 oct 1962, China invaded further and occupied Aksai Chin and also occupying galwan valley and Depsang Plains.

After the war ended in Indian defeat, the Chinese annexed the area but withdrawing 20 kms as a part of peace treaty ,thus again putting Galwan, Depsang Plains, finger 8, Hot springs into Indian territory. This is now the Line of Actual Control.

The Chinese thus again and again try to intrude into this 20 km band which they withdrew after Oct 1962. They started this from 2006,9,13 and in 2020.

As far as Congress is concerned the Chinese thus invaded India between 2001-2013, 14 times occupying 900-2000 sq km every time

Everytime China left, India agreed to create buffer zones within its own territory. Thus between 2001-2013, some 400 sq km land has been converted to buffer zones. This is called the Chinese Method of "Salami Slicing"

Now Let us see the 2020 clashes-

1. Galwan clash- Most violent claiming casualties, Chinese incursion thwarted

2. pangong Tso Lake – LAC runs at Finger 8. ie F-1 to F8 is Indian land as per Lac with Indian permanent camps at F3. Chinese invade and occupy area from F8 to F5 ie some 120 sq km land. India does counter incursion where she occupy heights of kailash range in south pangong(India

while crossing F8 joining line into Chinese land ie some 30 sqkm area. This area has now been disengaged with Chinese withdrawing back to F8, India withdrawing back to its land, India withdrawing from kailash heights.

No buffer zone has been created this time, the patrolling will resume as same from F3 to f8 as normal, however India has agreed not to set up any camp beyond F3 to F8. This might be called a quasi Buffer.

3. Depsang Plains

This area saw Chinese occupation 4 times under UPA regime, I will discuss 2020 only.

I might get bashed by BJP and bhaktas badly but what I feel Modi lied when he said not an inch of our land has been occupied

but many newspaperers have quoted that China is still sitting 18 kms inside India and if disengagement doesnot happen here, it is likely to annex 300 sqkm+ Indian land into it.

This is also the 20+ km band which china occupied in Oct 1962 but withdrew in Nov 1962 on international pressure and peace process. Thus china has crossed defacto LAC 18 kms inside, with both Indian and Chinese tanks just 500 m away

I might be wrong and would feel happy if someone proves me wrong here.

4. other Areas- (Hot springs, Gogra) I don't have actual correct information on it but it seems india has successfully thwarted the incursions)

END OF THREAD

THANKS