Twitter Thread by Amb. Shakir Akorede



Amb. Shakir Akorede
@akorive001



It's been hot takes on LGBTQ. Let's get some Islamic edu on "gender nonconformity" i.e. "identifying as a gender different from what was assigned at birth."

There're 64 genders* today—not just male/female anymore. Anything of such & how's gender established in Islam?

THREAD

Is gender about anatomy (the genital you were born with) or personal decision?

That's summarily the question this thread seeks to illuminate as per Islamic perspective. It doesn't matter if you're a Muslim or not. So far you're a knowledge-seeker and here for that, be my guest.

Like you're probably confused about the LGBTQ arguments, some persons around are confused about their biological sex and gender. The exact reason they (the few real ones among them - not trans) appear noncomformist.

This problem is called gender dysphoria.

Gender dysphoria is the feeling of unease that occurs in people whose gender identity differs from their sex assigned at birth or genitals (sex-related physical characteristics).

See attachments on gender identity, gender expression & sexual orientation. All.. different things.

What Is Gender Dysphoria?

The term “transgender” refers to a person whose sex assigned at birth (i.e. the sex assigned by a physician at birth, usually based on external genitalia) does not match their gender identity (i.e., one’s psychological sense of their gender). Some people who are transgender will experience **“gender dysphoria,”** which refers to psychological distress that results from an incongruence between one’s sex assigned at birth and one’s gender identity. Though gender dysphoria often begins in childhood, some people may not experience it until after puberty or much later.

People who are transgender may pursue multiple domains of gender affirmation, including social affirmation (e.g., changing one’s name and pronouns), legal affirmation (e.g., changing gender markers on one’s government-issued documents), medical affirmation (e.g., pubertal suppression or gender-affirming hormones), and/or surgical affirmation (e.g., vaginoplasty, facial feminization surgery, breast augmentation, masculine chest reconstruction, etc.). Of note, not all people who are transgender will desire all domains of gender affirmation, as these are highly personal and individual decisions.

Forward. Is there anything different from male/female known to Islam? Yes, there're gender-atypical persons.

1. The ambiguous khunth■ (al-khunth■ al-mushkil)
2. The congenital mukhannath (al-mukhannath al-khilq■)
3. The non-congenital mukhannath (al-mukhannath ghayr al-khilq■)

1. The Ambiguous Khunth■

An ambiguous khunth■ is someone who possesses both male & female organs or one who possesses none thus urinating from an opening in the body.

This problem nonetheless, scholars say the true gender must be ascertained. Why? See attachment.

They say so because, Islamically speaking, there are only two discrete genders for Allah says "We created you of a male and female (Q 49: 13); "He created the two mates—male and female" (Q 53:45); and “dispersed from both of them many men and women" (Q 4:1).

Mostly, the determinant of gender is the organ by which urine passes. If penis, then the ambiguous khunth■ is regarded as a male. If meatus, then the ambiguous khunth■ is a female. But if the place of passing urine is anatomically ambiguous... [continued]

If the urine passage is anatomically ambiguous, gender is established by post-puberty secondary features e.g beards, menstruation, breasts and/or related anatomical developments.

Once gender is established, the individual is no more ambiguous. He or she is male or female.

Absence of Genitalia

The complete absence of genitalia corresponds to what is clinically referred to as agenesis—penile or vaginal, depending on the gender. Despite the absence of critical male or female sexual organs, agenetic individuals generally possess an otherwise normal male or female anatomy. Accordingly, Islamic law regards the presence of discernable male or female anatomical characteristics as sufficient for establishing gender even in the absence of sexual organs.

Should all the above methods fail, the ambiguous khunth■ – considered “agendered” – remains ambiguous and unpermitted to marry according to the majority of jurists. A minority position thou allows such a person to make a non-retractable gender selection.

A minority position is reported from Imam al-Shāfi’ī allowing the khunthā to make a non-retractable gender selection, after which he or she would be required to live by the conventions and abide by the rulings of the chosen gender. If physiological gender can be established according to one of the methods mentioned, many current-day fuqahāʾ are of the view that surgery would be permissible to provide a corrective removal of the superfluous sexual organ.

2. The congenital mukhannath

Unlike the ambiguous khunth■, the mukhannath is unambiguously male i.e. has no anatomical or developmental ambiguities but uncontrollably has the mannerisms and affectations of females e.g. voice pitch, gait among other feminite attributes.

The source of this feminine predisposition is considered by the jurists to fall well outside of any reasonable control, with the result that the congenital mukhannath is considered blameless insofar as he exhibits traits that are dispositional (khilqī) to him and that he has no reasonable ability to change.

The naturally mukhannath (not the "my choice" o) is not culpable for anything but must make conscious efforts to change. In fact, there's no license for HIM to take on the avoidable affectations. Unlike voice pitch or gait, the way one dresses or adorns himself is conscious.

Scholars' position:

Imam al-Nawawī: Because this is a disposition upon which God created him, the congenital mukhannath carries no blame, no rebuke, no sin, and no penalty, and he is excused as he has no hand in that.

Al-Shirbīnī: Whoever behaves with the affectations of women in his mannerisms and behavior, that is impermissible . . . but if that is his disposition (khilqa), then there is no blame.

Ibn Baṭṭāl: Holding a dispositional mukhannath liable for feminine affectations would be akin to holding a person blameworthy for the color of his skin or the shape of his body.

Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī: Blame for imitating [women] in their speech and gait is specifically for the one who does so deliberately. As for him who, rooted in his created disposition, is like that, then he should be ordered to do his utmost to leave his affectations and what he has been habituated to gradually, for if he does not do so and persists in his ways, then he will be subject to blame.

Ibn Ḥajar asserts an obligation upon the mukhannath to endeavor to modify those traits that can, in fact, be normalized. For example, if a man's walk is effeminate, then perhaps he can correct that through a prolonged attempt at habituating himself to walk without feminine affectations.

The congenital mukhannath is prohibited from adopting female adorement & appearance just as the mutarajjila (a man-immitating womman) is prohibited from doing the opposite.

NB. the Prophet cursed the mukhannathun & their female equivalents and ordered their expulsion from homes.

Note that the mukhannath is actually permitted to enter and/or stay in the company of women generally. This very mukhannath is the one known today as feminine or effeminate. What grants him a stay in the midst of women is that "he lacks sexual desire for women, nor does he tell men matters that are private to women.

But if he comprehends the distinct characteristics of men and women like the banished mukhannath in the hadith below, then it is completely impermissible for such MAN to either seek or be granted entry into women's company in any way whatsoever because he is a pretender. By comprehending the interactive relations between women and men, he is no longer considered from those of whom Allah said "the attendants who possess no sexual desire"

The Prophet (SAW) cursed the mukhannathun and their female equivalents, mutarajjilat, and ordered that they should be removed them from homes. "Put them out of your houses, and put so-and-so out," he reportedly said. According to one hadith, this incident was prompted by a mukhannath servant of Muhammad's wife Umm Salama commenting upon the body of a woman.

Aisha says: Amukhannath used to enter upon the wives of the Prophet. They (the people) counted him among those who were free of physical needs. One day the Prophet entered upon us when he was with one of his wives, and was describing the qualities of a woman, saying: When she comes forward, she comes forward with four (folds of her stomach), and when she goes backward, she goes backward with eight (folds of her stomach). The Prophet said: Do I not see that this one knows what here lies. Then they (the wives) observed veil from him.

Concerning the congenital mukhannath, Ibn al-Jawz■ writes, explaining the hadith above: It is said that they are from those who possess no sexual desire (ghayr ul■ 'l-irba) i.e. for women. This reiterates the only condition such men can be allowed in the midst of women.

Quick one: scholars of Islam are unanimous in upholding Islam's unqualified prohibition of same-sex acts whatever the situation of, and regardless of the differing views on, congenital and non-congenital mukhannath[redacted]n. They are male.

3. The non-congenital mukhannath

The non-congenital mukhannath, unlike those congenitally effeminate, who deliberately chooses to adopt such affectations. Long story short, this set of persons are cursed. Hadith: "God has cursed effeminate men and mannish women."

Those not congenitally mukhannath who deliberately take on feminine mannerisms are subject to moral opprobrium on account of their impersonation of gender traits proper to the other sex that are not dispositional to them. Additionally, it was generally understood that many such persons affected effeminacy for the express purpose of carrying out immoral acts, typically as prostitutes offering themselves to other men as the passive partner.

Scholars classified the non-congenital mukhannath as a profligate, and subsumed such persons under the profile of the morally corrupt (fāsiqūn). Accordingly, jurists differed over whether one was permitted to pray behind a non-congenital mukhannath, admit his testimony in court, eat the meat he slaughtered, or marry upright women to him. To be sure, the act of deliberate effeminacy is no grounds for anathematization (takfīr) and the non-congenital mukhannath indeed remains a Muslim, albeit a sinful one.

Conclusion

This thread explains Gender in Islam, 90% gleaned from a research piece by Mobeen Vaid. Aside from the congenital mukhannath whom some scholars say could consider a medical operation to get rid of one of the sexual organs, LGBTQ+ is haram and accursed act in Islam.

The thread doesn't discuss the miscellany of transgender, homosexuality, same-sex marriage etc as the discussed topic already made that unnecessary. Should there be a need for that in future, however, it shall be offered.

Thanks for reading■

The essay:
https://t.co/zUafbmNKq0